**Qualitative Comparison Table – within case: Scotland**

| **Dimension** | **Corpus Analysis (mass media)** | **Interviews** | **Field Notes** | **Internet Ethnography (netnography)** | **Document Analysis** | **Key points of comparison** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Direct contact:**  **Conflict over oil exploration & extraction** | Topics related to oil and tourism are very well connected, no indicators of conflict. | - Only tangentially visible with talk about decommissioning and the historical Greenpeace conflict over the Brent Spar sinking, and a few discussions about anti-fracking movements in the UK. | - Not much here. | - Not highly visible. Notions of tourism and oil as incompatible development paths come up only a couple times: around limitations to sailing tourism due to oil sector shipping traffic around Aberdeen (Scottish Tourism Alliance), and around fracking conflicts in Lancashire (elsewhere in the UK, not Scotland specifically). | -N/A | - Not many signs of conflict. There are references to the Greenpeace Brent Spar conflict as a key historical event, and to anti-fracking movements, but these aren’t specifically linked to tourism.  (PM: really interesting how Brent Spar has been memorialized, become a key event. Interesting comparisons re: BP spill, 2010. Distinct part of this case, and cuts across many dimensions.) |
| **Direct contact:**  **Threat of oil extraction as “envirotisement” for tourism – increasing tourism as strategy for opposition to oil** | - Not present. | - Not really visible. | - Not much here. | - Not really visible. | -N/A | - Not present. |
| **Direct contact:**  **Oil as a tourism attractor** | - Not really present, but topic focused on tourism, history, coast, also includes keywords of gas, energy. | - Yes, this comes up, particularly in relation to the Aberdeen Maritime Museum. | -The main themes related to the interface of tourism and oil are oil as a tourism attractor in sites like the Aberdeen Maritime Museum, science centres, Firth of Forth boat tour (linked with discourses of oil industry contribution to climate change, carbon capture and storage, co-existence of fossil fuels and renewables; as well as Shell as a key organizational actor), and relatedly oil and tourism as complementary development paths.  - This comes up at a couple key points in coding for history as a tourism attractor, with particular reference to the Aberdeen Maritime Museum, and boat tour in the Firth of Forth.  - In these types of sites, this is where we often see discourses or enactments of coastal environments as sites of oil extraction.  - Coding on oil risk mitigation also comes up particularly in relation to oil-as-tourism sites, where risk management regimes are generally enacted for tourists in a positive light as ensuring the safety and sustainability of the oil sector. | - This comes up primarily related to the Aberdeen Maritime Museum as a key site, and is linked to framing coastal environments as sites of oil extraction, and presenting touristic narratives of oil as an important part of regional culture and history.  - The notion of oil as a key part of history and culture comes up in several coding references, but entirely through the Aberdeen Maritime Museum site, which is a key site of enacting oil history as a tourism attractor. | -N/A | - Oil appears as a tourism attractor at sites like the Aberdeen Maritime Museum, science centres, boat tours (i.e. Firth of Forth), demonstrating co-existence and the ways positive narratives about oil as part of regional culture and history are enacted and presented for tourists. |
| **Direct contact:**  **Oil money supports tourism development** | - Not really present, but topic focused on tourism, history, coast, also includes keywords of gas, energy. | - Yes, this comes up in terms of the oil sector creating infrastructure (i.e. flight connectivity, accommodation, restaurants) that also benefit tourism development and the tourism sector. | - We see this in corporate sponsorships of tourist sites, particularly in instances of oil-as-tourism. | - This doesn’t come up a lot, but in a couple specific contexts around oil sector (i.e. BP) sponsorship of arts and culture, which is indirectly tourism-related), and company sponsorships (i.e. Maersk) of the Aberdeen Maritime Museum. | -N/A | - This comes up in a couple ways: 1) in a more general sense in the ways that the oil sector creates infrastructure that benefits tourism development; and 2) through oil sector sponsorship of tourism sites, including (those with an oil-oriented tourism focus. |
| **Indirect contact:**  **tourism is carbon intensive** | - Tourism topic includes keyword for airport – carbon intensive mobility. | - Aeromobility comes up for most participants. Sometimes, but not always, this is linked to environmental drawbacks and tourism contributions to climate change, though other times, it is not invoked as a problem but simply in discussions of tourism connectivity.  - Automobility is also discussed by several participants in relation to environmental drawbacks of tourism, especially since much of rural Scotland is more accessible by car and lack of public transit alternatives is a barrier.  - A few participants (tourism sector and government; with multiple coding references) focus on the carbon intensive footprint of tourism, mostly related to aeromobility and automobility. At the same time, they talk about local (organizational, community) efforts at mitigation, but also some talk about more structural technological innovations that could help address the issue of aeromobility & automobility climate footprints. | - A bit of an outlier, but an interesting moment on climate change & government responses comes from the Wild Scotland conference, where there is talk about government-tourism collaboration to improve the sustainability & carbon efficiency of tourism sector operators.  - Automobility comes up a lot in the fieldnotes, in terms of tourism mobilities. It is rarely explicitly linked to the carbon footprint/intensity of tourism, rather is mostly cross-referenced with dominant tourism attractors (coastal environments, historic sites, mountain landscapes, food and drink) and hiking. It is a key technological mediation enabling tourism mobility, but rarely the subject of environmental reflexivity. | - Among mobilities, automobility comes up most frequently, but only across a few sites, only one of which (Rabbies Tours) is specifically tourism-oriented. The Rabbies site orients around bus tours, and frames this around sustainable tourism (i.e. be reducing # of cars, by getting people from cars to buses). Rabbies also uses several environmental measures (including a “self-imposed carbon tax”) and has won a green tourism award for their sustainability efforts. | -N/A | - Automobility and Aeromobility come up a lot as pathways for tourist travel. This is often presented uncritically, but there is also environmental reflexivity about the carbon intensity of tourism travel and links to climate change. There is also material on measures to mitigate or address this through technological innovation or sustainability practices. There is also some reflection about how the lack of transportation alternatives leads to a more carbon-intensive, car-dependent tourism sector. |
| **Indirect contact:**  **tourism environments impacted by climate change** | - Climate change is marginal to network. | - Not a major recurring discourse, but climate change impacts on tourism environments comes up in relation to skiing and Highland landscapes, more than in relation to coastal landscapes. | - The fieldnotes identify a couple key points where climate change risks and impacts are related to tourism environments, this is particularly at the Scottish Seabird Centre and related boat tour, which highlights climate change among a suite of issues (ocean plastics, offshore oil) that are negatively impacting seabirds. This also illustrates a tourism space of environmental education. | - Across several tourism sector and ENGO sites, coastal environments appear as fragile and vulnerable to climate change risks and impacts through sea level rise, flooding, impacts on wildlife and biodiversity. | - Significant climate change impacts including increasingly severe extreme weather events, sea level rise, coastal erosion, shifting animal, plant, and fish ranges. Scotland may also be subject to further disruption as/if ocean currents change significantly in terms of its climate (much like Iceland and Norway). | - Climate change comes up somewhat peripherally, but at tourist sites as part of environmental education. Impacts on coastal environments include severe weather, coastal erosion, sea level rise, impacts on wildlife and biodiversity. The other tourism-oriented landscape impacted by climate change is the Highlands in relation to skiing. |
| **Indirect contact:**  **oil infrastructure supports tourism** | - Not really present, but topic focused on tourism, history, coast, also includes keywords of gas, energy. | - This comes up for participants in terms of aeromobility and oil-tourism interface as complimentary development paths, as the air connectivity for the oil sector also benefits the tourism sector in terms of increasing connectivity.  - This comes up a few times talking about oil and tourism as complimentary development paths, that oil economies contribute to developing infrastructure (air travel routing, airport, hotels, amenities) that also is useful for tourism development. | - Not much here. | - Not a major theme, but comes up in the Oil & Gas UK site, how oil development (WRT Shetland, particularly) has helped build infrastructure and amenities that create spin-off benefits for the tourism sector. | -N/A | - This contact point comes up particularly in interviews, where oil development is seen as supporting infrastructure that also benefits tourism (air routing, airport capacity, hotels, restaurants). This is part of seeing these as complimentary development paths and seeing the oil sector as having spill-over benefits for tourism development. |
| **Culture:**  **Mediated representations of coastal communities & environments as spaces for nature-based tourism and oil extraction** | - The discourse is dominated by three major, very interconnected topics focused on: oil, business; oil, finance, independence, government; tourism, history, coastal environments. | - In terms of tourism landscapes, the main thing that comes up across interviewees is not the coastal landscape itself as a tourism attractor, but rather the (inland) Highlands landscapes that are more often positioned as the iconic Scottish tourism landscape (across tourism, government and oil participants). This is similar to Iceland: both rely on coastal activities and attractors, but for both inland landscapes are just as (or more so) iconic and important. The Highlands landscape is often linked to food & drink, history as a tourism attractor, and hiking as a core part of what draws visitors.  - Relatedly, the parks and protected areas that come up more often are Cairngorms (in the Highlands) and Loch Lamond and the Trossachs, which are also shows the importance of inland mountain/highlands spaces as part of the tourism imaginary/destination image, linked to history and food and drink as tourism attractors.  - The importance of coastal environments and seascapes, however, is also raised by a few participants.  - Wilderness discourse is also invoked in terms of defining the Scottish landscape and part of the tourism appeal, that it is relatively wilderness, and easily accessible from urban hubs.  - In terms of the main iconic animals that are invoked to characterize coastal environments, the main ones that come up recurrently (in terms of # of references, but concentrated among a few government and tourism participants) are dolphins, seals, and seabirds. These are mentioned together, and linked to coding for boat tours, photography as tourism practice, and tourism as a space for environmental education.  - In terms of modes of interaction, hiking is the most frequently invoked across a range of participants, mostly in references to mountains/highlands as a tourism attractor. Other key modes of interaction include golf, skiing (also more in reference to the Highlands and Cairngorms National Park), and cruise ships. These modes of interaction often connect with talk about history as a tourism attractor, as well as food and drink.  - There are a set of recurrent cultural/historical attractors that come up across participants from tourism, energy sector, and government: arts, craft & culture (mostly focused on the cultural side, i.e. Edinburgh festival); food and drink as performance (mostly referencing whisky); history as a tourism attractor (mostly referencing castles, but also history and heritage more broadly). These are often linked to golf and hiking as modes of interaction.  - Relatedly, coding for Tourism Destination Image often connects with history as a tourism attractor and food and drink (primarily whiskey) as tourism performance.  - Several (4) participants talk about mass media representations ordering tourism mobility. This includes literature (i.e. Walter Scott, who comes up for a couple participants) creating a romantic imaginary of the Highlands in the 19th century (with a reference to Braveheart as a more modern version of the Highlands romantic), as well as film imagery of places like Skye, or references to Trainspotting and Edinburgh. | - In terms of tourism environments, the three prominent themes that emerge are the coastline/seascape as focal point; mountain landscapes; and highlands, all of which cross-reference with each other to a certain degree, and also to hiking and history as a tourism attractor. Coastlines are also repeatedly linked with seabirds and beachwalking, while mountain landscapes and highlands also connect with food and drink as tourism attractors & collective identity, and with lochs as another iconic part of the Scottish tourism landscape. These are the defining landscape elements, with hiking coming up as the main mode of interaction with this tourism landscape.  - The main animals that come up to define the coastal environment are puffins, (other) seabirds, and seals. These animals come up in relation to each other, but also in reference to the coastline/seascape as focal point, boat tours, tourism as a space for environmental education, the Scottish Seabird Centre (for puffins and seabirds), and the Forvie Nature Reserve (for seals). Coding for seals, in particular, also cross-references to photography as a tourist practice.  - In terms of modes of interaction, hiking is definitely the most frequently invoked, often linked with the coastline/seascape as a focal point, mountain landscape as a focal point, history as a tourism attractor, food and drink as tourism attractors, and references to notes on Cairngorms National Park.  - Other particularly recurrent modes of interaction with the environment that come up include beach walking (linked to coastal landscape, seals, seabirds); boat tours (linked with photography as tourism practice and the Scottish Seabird Centre); and golf (linked with food & drink, coastal, mountain and highland landscapes, food & drink), and all of these often linked to history as a tourism attractor.  - The most recurrent park/protected area is Cairngorms, which is not coastal but in the highlands (not surprising, as well, given fieldwork time there). This is cross-coded with hiking and mountain landscapes, unsurprisingly, but also skiing and cycling.  - The dominant themes related to culture & collective identity in the field notes all relate to tourism development, and also often cross-reference with each other: art, craft & culture as tourism attractors (often cross-coded with folklore & landscape, deer, mountain landscape as focal point); food & drink as tourism attractors (often cross-coded with the coastline/seascape as focal point, mountain landscape as focal point, and hiking); and history as a tourism attractor (often cross-coded with boat tours, coastline/seascape as focal point, highlands; there are also a couple key points where this connects to oil as a tourism attractor).  - There are several instances of photography as tourism practice, from across a range of sites, which are linked to particular activities (hiking, boat tours) and attractors (seals, historic sites as tourism attractors).  - Relatedly, aquamobilities (as distinct from cruise ships and boat tours) also come up across various sites, often in relation to history as a tourism attractor (i.e. maritime and shpping histories).  - Coastal environments as sites of oil extraction also come up recurrently, often linked to oil as a tourism attractor (i.e. at the Aberdeen Maritime Museum or science centres and museums), and history as a tourism attractor. In narratives of coasts as sites of oil extraction, there is also some connection to discourses of oil industry contributions to climate change, the notion of the “energy trilemma” and renewable energy transitions. | - In terms of tourism environments, the dominant theme is the coastline/seascape as focal point, which is cross-referenced with mountain landscapes and seabirds.  - The ecological value of coastal areas also comes up repeatedly, but concentrated in three sites (government and NGO), cross-referenced with seabirds, puffins, and notions of nature as fragile and vulnerable.  - With regard to animals, a cluster of different animals come up, mostly in the context of tourism-related sites, but also in the context of NGO sites, including puffins, whales, seals, and dolphins, which are often cross-coded with each other, and with boat tours and beachwalking as modes of interaction with coastal environments. Interestingly, there is also key points where oil company sites also invoke iconic animals as website imagery (i.e. Shell using whales and other marine life).  - The two main modes of interaction that come up are a) boat tours, primarily in tourism sites, and often linked with whales and puffins, and also linked to material on cruise ship tourism; b) hiking, also primarily in tourism sites, and often linked with camping, cycling, the environment as a site of adventure. Birdwatching also comes up across multiple sites.  - The main park and protected area that comes up (but only across a couple sites) is Cairngorms National Park, which is also cross-coded with Loch Lamond and the Trossachs NP and Scottish Borders NP. So, as in other data, showing the importance of inland/highland parks and protected areas as tourism sites. However, there are also several coding references to Marine Protected Areas across four sites (ENGO, gov’t and oil). Marine protected areas come up alongside talk about impacts of climate change, but also as a potential impediment to oil development.  - Looking at the cultural dimensions of tourism, the most prevalent theme that comes up is history as a tourism attractor (across tourism-oriented sites), linked with coastlines and seascapes, and rural communities as sites of history and authenticity.  - There are repeated references to notions of rural communities as sites of history and authenticity, across tourism sites but also one oil sector site.  - Particularly visible in the Aberdeen Maritime Museum site, we see the discourse of coastal environments as sites of oil extraction as a key part of regional history and culture.  - Coastal environments as sites of oil extraction also come up repeatedly, mostly in oil sector websites, but also particularly in the Aberdeen Maritime Museum site. This also gets cross-coded with oil sector corporate environmental sustainability discourse. | - In terms of tourism landscapes, the “package” that forms the TDI (to varying degrees for different market segments) are the spectacular landscape, outdoor recreation, history (i.e. castles, monuments, museums), culture, and food.  - Coastal environments are valued as sites of oil extraction, though mature/post-peak fields are an issue, with Scottish production peaking in 1999 and subsequently declining.  - Interestingly, there is also the idea that former oil extraction sites may be well suited as CCS sites. | - More of the data focuses on tourism-oriented representations. The TDI (Tourism Destination Image) “package” includes a bundle of inland and coastal landscapes (highlands, mountains, coastal places); attractors (food and drink, history); modes of interaction (hiking, boat tours, cruise ships, golf); and wildlife (seabirds, puffins, dolphins, seals, whales).  - Coastal environments as sites of oil extraction also comes up frequently, particularly via the oil sector and at oil-oriented tourism sites, including museum and science centre displays. Part of the narrative of coastal environments as sites of oil extraction is that the Scottish North Sea is largely a post-peak seascape, so issues of decommissioning are increasingly important.  - These varied representations of coastal environments don’t really come into conflict. The corpus analysis similarly shows a high degree of interconnection between oil and tourism-oriented themes, though oil is more linked to economy and government, while tourism is more linked to coastal environments. |
| **Culture:**  **Discourses of positive & negative social-environmental impacts of tourism development** | - Tourism topic doesn’t really speak explicitly to positive/negative impacts or affective dimension. | - Across the interview participants, there is quite a bit of reflexivity around the environmental dimensions of tourism, and sense of ambiguity. Sustainability discourse is often invoked (by 10 participants across sectors), linked to the positive impacts of tourism for host communities, but also to coding for environmental drawbacks. The notion of tourism as a space for environmental education is also invoked by 9 participants across sectors, linked to seals, and hiking,  - Conversely, environmental drawbacks of tourism are also invoked by 8 participants, mostly around issues of local ecological damage and degradation, overcrowding, waste, cross-coded with hiking, camping, automobility. The broader issue of aeromobility and its ecological impacts are also raised by a couple participants.  - Both automobility and aeromobility are recurrent themes, often linked to the environmental drawbacks of tourism, or tourism contributions to climate change (esp. aeromobility).  - The issue of codes of conduct for tourists is linked to both sustainability discourse and environmental drawbacks and challenges for host communities, and often linked to hiking. Better rules of conduct can help mitigate environmental drawbacks, and ensure tourism sustainability.  - Wilderness values come up in talk about the downside of tourism, insofar as expanding development (i.e. hotels, shopping malls etc…) can negatively impact on wilderness values.  - Hiking is the most frequently discussed mode of interaction with tourism landscapes. Here, we see talk about localized environmental impacts, such as trail erosion on trails, but also issues of localized waste and accommodating RVs as localized negative impacts of nature tourism that require better conduct from tourists, but also changes to infrastructure. i.e. the change to cable cars to get people off some of the most over-used and impacted trails in Cairngorms national park is invoked multiple times to illustrate the negative impacts and solutions to local environments.  - Talk about National Parks, which focuses mostly on Cairngorms and Loch Lamond and the Trossachs, includes talk about environmental drawbacks of tourism, focusing on local environmental impacts like trail erosion, overcrowding of camping areas, waste, etc… but also talk about building tourism governance, developing better rules of conduct for tourists.  - Socio-economic challenges of tourism for host communities are raised by 10 participants, which are linked to the notion that tourism is underdeveloped and the need to further tourism development (i.e. in more remote and rural areas, but also in Aberdeen), also linked to the notion of overcrowding of tourism space and also automobility – i.e. overcrowding in more remote and rural communities, and issues that rural tourism in Scotland is very automobility-dependent.  - Positive impacts of tourism, by contrast, are also brought up by most (9) participants, linked primarily to economic impacts and sustainability discourse (as well as often cross-referenced to talk about food and drink as tourism attractors). | - Coding for social-economic dimensions of tourism has both challenges and positive impacts as main themes (often linked to each other), and much of this coming from the event ethnography notes. In terms of challenges (which actually has more coding references than positive impacts), this is often linked with Brexit (uncertainty, human resource and labour issues), and to the issue of Air BnB (how to regulate/manage and adopt to technological change.  - Coding for positive impacts is often linked to sustainability discourse, as well as key tourism attractors (history, food & drink) and modes of interaction (hiking). Positive impacts are also sometimes specifically linked to impacts for rural host communities.  - Another key theme related to the social-economic dimensions of tourism is the need to respond to technological innovation and adaptation in the tourism sector, which is linked to key actors (Uber, Air BnB), as well as to talk about practices of media work and the notion that social media increasingly orders tourism mobility. This is also linked to talk about age, in terms of transitions towards the Gen Y/millennial travellers (as baby boomers age out of the tourism market).  - There are several instances, across a range of sites, where tourism works as a site of environmental education – primarily in terms of ecological education, rather than environmental issues per se, though there are also places where energy & climate change issues (i.e. the energy trilemma are explored in the context of tourist sites. This material is often cross-coded with seabirds, puffins, gannets, boat tours, and the coastline as focal point, and is particularly pronounced at the Scottish Seabird Centre as a site.  - Sustainability discourse is also invoked at several points across a range of field sites. This is also cross-coded with the positive impacts of tourism for host communities, tourism as a space of environmental education, and seabirds. In this context, Scottish Natural Heritage and the Scottish Seabird Centre come up as key actors/sites. | - Positive impacts for tourism are a significant recurring theme, across a broad range of tourism and government sites. This is mostly framed through economic impacts, but also through community and social impacts from tourism (versus the more economistic/employment focus of the impacts of the oil sector). This is also linked to coding for tourism legitimates nature preservation, history as a tourism attractor.  - Material on tourism sector responses to climate change comes up across a few tourism sector sites, linked with tourism sustainability discourse and coding on green tourism certification schemes, as well as material on automobility.  - While not the most prevalent themes related to sustainability discourse, there are repeated coding references for tourism as a space of environmental education (7), which connects to the ecological value of coastal areas, renewable energy transitions, and risks & impacts of climate change. This is invoked across 4 sites (both tourism and ENGO, especially the Scottish Seabird Centre and Royal Society for the Protection of Birds (RSPB).  - Relatedly, tourism sustainability discourse also comes up (6 references) across six tourism websites. This links to material on green tourism certification schemes, tourism responses to climate change, and to talk about positive economic and social impacts of tourism for host communities. | - Tourism is highly valued as for its employment and revenue benefits. The sector is well developed and appears well supported as an important part of the Scottish economy. | - There is quite a bit of acknowledgement or reflection on both positive and negative impacts of tourism development.  - Positive impacts are often viewed through an economic lens, as an economic driver, but also in terms of social, community and environmental impacts. Tourism development can be particularly beneficial to more rural areas, and is often seen as a relatively sustainable development pathway compared to resource extraction. It can legitimate nature preservation and provide sites of environmental education. There is also a significant focus on tourism sustainability and green tourism practices/initiatives.  - At the same time there is also quite a bit of reflection on drawbacks. These include localized social and environmental drawbacks, such as overcrowding, trail degradation, impacts on wilderness values of infrastructure development, need to manage Air BnB, etc… Localized impacts are largely things to manage via tourism governance, cultivating better standards of behaviour among visitors, etc… rather than a rationale to turn away from tourism development.  - There is also attention to extra local impacts, particularly the carbon intensity of automobility and Aeromobility and tourism’s connection to climate change via these transportation networks. |
| **Culture: Discourses of positive & negative social-environmental impacts of oil extraction** | - Oil is very much linked to finance, business, independence, and government. Implicitly positive re: economic wellbeing and potential for independence. | - The notion that oil is an important part of history & culture comes up for four participants, across both the oil and tourism sector, including in a great deal of depth in relation to the Aberdeen Maritime Museum. This links to the positive social-economic impacts of oil, with a recurring narrative that the oil sector contributing to significant social-economic renewal in Aberdeen in the wake of the decline of fisheries economies, that Aberdeen went from a fishing centre to a more prosperous, developed oil city. The oil sector is woven into narratives of the historical trajectory of the region in a generally positive light, due to its economic and social contributions. This also cross-codes with talk about oil and tourism as complimentary development paths.  - The main themes that come up in relation to coastal environments and oil are: decommissioning old wells, mature fields as an issue (these two linked to each other, and also to coding for the challenges of oil for host communities, as well as renewable energy transitions). The other recurrent theme is around coastal environments as sites of oil extraction, which is also linked to talk about peak oil and envisioning post-oil societies, but also to talk about the oil sector as a field of technological innovation, and the oil-tourism interface as complimentary development paths.  - Relatedly, the most common social futures theme is renewable energy transitions, linked to discussion of peak oil, decommissioning old wells, government response to climate change, and the role of the oil sector in responding to climate change.  - The notion that the oil sector has a role responding to climate change comes up recurrently, albeit for only a couple participants (oil sector and government). Here, the focus is on improving the carbon intensity of oil extraction via technological improvements, lowering the carbon footprint of the oil sector through the emerging low-carbon transition. Here, we see a narrative of the oil sector as an actor that can use tech innovation in responding to climate change. However, this is embedded within the notion that oil will remain a core part of the energy system throughout any low-carbon transition.  - Talk about environmental issues includes several references by participants (mostly government, also tourism) to problems, controversies and opposition around proposed fracking for Scotland. Interestingly, a tourism participant mentions this in relation to the generally positive narrative about the impacts of oil on Scotland.  - Similarly, there are also several invocations from government, tourism and oil participants of negative impacts of renewable energy, mostly related to the siting of wind farms in terms of aesthetic (wilderness values) and wildlife impacts.  - However, in talk about social futures, the most frequent theme (6 participants) focuses on renewable energy transitions, which is often linked with talk about government performance and policy related to climate change, the role of oil in responding to climate change (i.e. in transferring skills and expertise from oil to the renewables field), discussions of peak oil, and the notion that the transition to low-carbon economies will be slow and that oil is part of the foreseeable future.  - A recurrent notion (4 participants) is that the oil sector also structures mobility and migration to Scotland (and oil hubs like Aberdeen), this is linked to notions of the oil sector as an international network, and is generally framed in terms of positive impacts of the oil sector. This is also linked to the idea of oil and tourism as complimentary development paths, both of which are beneficial. i.e. as new migrants come to Aberdeen they also become tourists in their new home. It also speaks to idea of local-global connectivity.  - The challenges of oil for host communities are also raised by several (7) participants from across sectors, often cross-referenced to the notion that the oil sector is cyclical and volatile, and that this is one of the drawbacks of being highly connected to the sector.  - However, talk about drawbacks also occurs alongside talk about the positive socio-economic impacts of oil for host communities, which are discussed by 10 participants. For several participants, talk about the positive economic impacts of oil also go along with viewing tourism and oil as complimentary development paths.  - The co-occurrence of talk about the socio-economic drawbacks and benefits of oil in this field indicates a bit more nuanced view of the sector than either boosterism or criticism, though the timing of the data collection (during price declines) probably shapes the critical view that the cyclical, volatile nature of the oil sector represents a significant challenge for host communities. | - The main themes related to social-economic impacts of oil (from the Oil & Gas UK event ethnography) are about how the current price downturn is necessitating a restricting of the industry (linked to notions of the oil industry as cyclical and volatile, that we’re in a tough period for the sector), but also the notion of optimism that there will be a rebound for the sector (which has proven somewhat true since the March 2017 event). These themes are also sometimes lined to talk about renewable energy transitions and the co-existence of fossil fuels and renewables. Less prevalent, but related themes are that it is currently a tough economic climate for the oil sector, and that tough times mean less oil exploration.  - The main climate change themes focus on government policy responses, risks and impacts, and the notion of the energy trilemma, the only theme to really directly get at the implications of the oil sector in climate change. This is a term that also comes up in interviews, and seems particularly salient in the Scottish field, the notion that energy systems have to be responsive to environmental sustainability (climate change), a growing global energy need, and Scottish economic wellbeing. There are a few key tourist sites that talk about oil and the energy trilemma (science centres and museums), which highlight the role of the oil industry in contributing to climate change, the coast as a site of oil extraction, and the renewable energy transition.  - While not as visible, perhaps, as in the interviews, the thematic focus on decommissioning old wells and discussion of mature fields also come up here as issues currently facing the Scottish oil sector.  - The main theme on oil governance that comes up centres on oil risk mitigation, particularly related to oil-as-tourism sites (Aberdeen Maritime Museum, boat tour @ the Firth of Forth), where risk mitigation is generally portrayed in a positive light as ensuring the safety and sustainability of the oil sector. A particularly interesting moment (@ the Aberdeen Maritime Museum) focuses on the Greenpeace Brent Spar conflict, which enacts a narrative that this conflict increased attention and performance to risk management/mitigation in the oil sector.  - In terms of social futures, the main thematic coding is for renewable energy transitions and (relatedly) oil-renewables co-existence. This material is often from oil-tourism sites sites like science centres, Maritime Museum, etc… where these themes are discussed in relation to oil’s contribution to climate change, climate change policy, and the idea of the energy trilemma and oil cosmopolitanism. | - Positive social-economic impacts of oil for host communities is a major recurring theme across oil sector and government sites, as well as oil-tourism sites (Aberdeen Maritime Museum), mostly defined through employment benefits and broader economic benefits. This is also often cross-coded with the notion that oil risk mitigation is well done.  - Oil industry use of sustainability discourse comes up quite often (16 coding references across 5 sites), particularly prevalent among Shell, Oil & Gas UK, and Equinor, and related to material on decommissioning old wells, oil risk mitigation, and the co-existence of fossil fuels and renewables.  - Relatedly, corporate environmental responsibility also comes up repeatedly in relation to the oil sector (particularly for Shell and Wood Mackenzie), and is also linked to decommissioning and sustainability discourse, but also to coastal environments as sites of oil extraction.  - Oil as a source of environmental risk comes up repeatedly, mostly in ENGO sites, but also in oil and government sites (in the latter, more in terms of acknowledging risk and discussing management/mitigation). Discussions of oil as a source of risk often link to seabirds, and also often arise in the context of parallel discussions of other environmental issues including climate change risks & impacts, and biodiversity issues.  - Seabirds come up in relation to oil as a source of environmental risk and bird and wildlife protection, in the context of ENGO sites.  - The notion of oil sector responding to climate change comes up across a range of energy sector sites, mostly framed in terms of technological innovation and oil and sustainability discourse. For a couple organizations (i.e. Maersk, Equinor) this is also linked to coding for transitioning away from oil development.  - Decommissioning old rigs also comes up across multiple sites, mostly oil sector and the Aberdeen Maritime Museum, cross-coded with corporate environmental responsibility and oil sector sustainability discourse.  - Coding for social futures themes focuses on renewable energy transitions, across a range of sites from all sectors. This is linked to framing of nature as fragile or vulnerable, as well as material on government performance and policy on climate change.  - With regard to social futures, there are also several coding references to oil-renewable energy co-existence, though by contrast this is more concentrated in oil sector websites (i.e. Equinor, Shell, BP). This is often linked to coding for oil industry sustainability discourse, coastal environments as sites of oil extraction, and positive social-economic impacts of oil for host communities. | - Oil is a major economic driver, with Scotland being the largest oil producer in the EU (so, excluding Norway). The benefits are defined primarily in economic terms of employment numbers and revenues. However, the Scottish oil sector is dealing with mature/post-peak fields as an issue. | - Much of the discourse of the oil sector is very positive, linked with economic development, but also positioning oil as an important part of regional history and culture, and also linked to the potential for Scottish independence.  - This generally positive narrative is disturbed by the recent price downturn and issues of volatility, which are hurting oil-dependent communities and need to be navigated through restructuring, policy change, etc…  - Oil risks to coastal environments and impacts in terms of climate change are acknowledged, but risk mitigation is generally seen as well-done, and there is an optimistic emphasis on technological innovation as a route to addressing the climate impacts of the sector. An interesting (and unique to Scotland) point is the ways the Brent Spar conflict is invoked occasionally as a key moment that provoked better environmental responsibility in the sector.  - The Scottish case also includes a particular focus on the “energy trilemma”: the world has a growing demand for energy; oil is tied to economic development and wellbeing in Scotland; we are living in an increasingly carbon-constrained world that demands climate action. The challenge (or trillema) is how to balance these three competing priorities.  - Decomissioning is also an interesting part of the Scottish discourse, including discussions about how to do this in an environmentally responsible manner, and whose financial responsibility and burden (i.e. corporate sector vs. public sector) it is to manage decommissioning. |
| **Culture:**  **Dominant discourse of relationship between oil & tourism as different development pathways – antagonism, co-existence, or silos (black-boxing)** | - Topics related to oil and tourism are both quite central and very strongly connected. Parallel pathways? Indicator of co-existence? | - Also, in coding for key culture and identity themes (arts, craft & culture; food & drink; history; oil as important part of history & culture), the notion of co-existence of tourism and oil comes up a few times, that the two development paths are largely separate and complementary economic drivers, not in contact or conflict.  - Of the coding for themes related to the oil-tourism interface, the most common is that they are complimentary development paths (for 9 participants), while only a couple participants see them as incompatible and 1 argues that oil development crowds out tourism development. The most direct point of contact is where oil itself is a tourism attractor (noted by a couple participants), but this theme also links to aeromobility, history as a tourism attractor, and the positive impacts of oil for host communities. | - Where the interface of sectors does come up, it is primarily as compatible development paths, which is most notable in instances of oil as tourism attractor.  - In coding for history as a tourism attractor, this is linked at a couple key points to the notion of oil as a tourism attractor (i.e. Aberdeen Maritime Museum, Firth of Forth boat tour).  - Narratives of oil-renewable energy co-existence and renewable energy transitions come up within oil-as-tourism sites. | - Where the oil-tourism interface comes up, it is either mostly as separate but compatible development paths, or in instances of oil as a tourism attractor (i.e. Aberdeen Maritime Museum). | - Mostly, connections appear to be black-boxed, with both development pathways highly valued in terms of their economic and employment contributions. No episodes of conflict or contention come up between sectors. | - Specific connections are often black boxed – tourism and oil are often interpreted as parallel, but complimentary development pathways, not in contact or conflict.  - There are also points where they are seen as complimentary and co-existing development paths, i.e. in talk about how oil infrastructure supports tourism development, or more explicitly in oil-oriented tourism sites or content.  - Interpretations of oil and tourism as incompatible or antagostic are marginal, though there is a counter-discourse that oil development can have the effect of crowding out tourism development. |
| **Governance:**  **Political spaces for engagement across oil & tourism** | - Tourism and oil topics are both central and strongly connected. Keywords explicitly linked to government and politics, though, are clustered more with oil, finance, independence. | - Not really visible. Generally speaking, they are viewed as complimentary development paths, but generally not perceived as in direct contact, but rather in more indirect forms of contact. There are a few instances of talk about tourism/government actors involved in oil governance around risk management/mitigation in protected areas, however. | - While there are repeated and diverse instances of oil-as-tourism cultural enactments at tourism spaces, there is little evidence of political engagement across sectors in terms of governance. | - While there are key themes related to oil governance (oil risk mitigation, climate policy & performance), there is very little on tourism governance in the netnography data. | -N/A | - Overall, there is a sense of oil and tourism as complimentary development paths (including through oil-as-tourism sites). The corpus analysis has both as central and strongly linked to each other, though oil clusters more with government, politics, and independence. That said, there is little direct engagement across sectors in the political sphere. |
| **Governance:**  **“vertical” element – governance as local, regional, national, international** | - Independence is key part of one of the topics that also orients around government, finance, and oil.  - The tourism topic, by contrast, is linked with community, city, as keywords, but less to government-oriented keywords (i.e. tourism as local, oil as national?). | - Among themes related to oil governance, the notion that Aberdeen, as an oil hub city, has failed to really capture the benefits of oil is invoked by a few participants, both from government and tourism. This tied to challenges of oil for host communities, and also notions of the oil industry as cyclical and volatile – i.e. Aberdeen failed to fully benefit during the good times, and now is suffering during the downturn.  - In talk about governance, there is also the notion of multiple interests in the oil sector, in terms of interests of the UK and Scottish government, as well as multiple interests within the oil sector. This can lead to points of tension, as well as to a diffuse and fragmented field, though one participant notes this is getting better in terms of contact and collaboration. Tensions between the UK and Scottish government are raised, for example, in terms of discussion about decommissioning and government responsibility.  - Brexit comes up with a couple of government participants in relation to tourism governance. This is another place where we see tension between Scottish government actors (SNP) and the UK, as well as points of tension between tourism sector interests and government.  - The Scottish independence referendum/movement also gets invoked by a couple participants, but more in relation to oil in terms of thinking about distributions of oil revenues, but also costs of forthcoming decommissioning between the Scottish and UK governments.  - Material on oil-government collaboration also makes mention to the World Energy Cities Partnership (discussed at length by one participant in particular), which points to both the vertical and horizontal dimensions of oil governance, as bridging the local and transnational in terms of the relationship of municipalities with the oil sector. | - The main critical political event that comes up, in relation to both oil and tourism, is Brexit, which is seen as creating a great deal of uncertainty and unpredictability in both sectors. Additionally, in relation to tourism, Brexit is creating challenges in terms of human resources, as a sector highly depending on EU migration and mobility. In fieldnotes from tourism events, we see talk about tourism- (Scottish) government collaboration to try to respond to the challenges of Brexit. There is also some cross-coding here with the notion of a Scottish Independence referendum, though this has far fewer coding references than Brexit, as another source of uncertainty and instability.  - It only comes up a few times (at the ScotHot event in Glasgow), but the notion that tourism regulations need to be re-evaluated to reflect the shifting technological landscape (i.e. Air BnB, Uber) is interesting, and speaks to issues of vertical scale – i.e. managing tourism governance at the local-regional level while technological change is globalizing the field and bringing in globally mobile key actors. | - Not much here. | -N/A | - The main thing that relates to the vertical dimension is tensions between Scotland and the UK, including around independence and Brexit, which is creating uncertainty, challenges, and tension.  - The vertical dimension also comes up in the corpus analysis with oil clustering more around government in general, while tourism is clustered more around city and community.  - The vertical dimension also comes up with regard to Aberdeen as an oil city that has not been overly successful at capturing the social benefits of oil at the local level.  - With regard to tourism, the vertical dimension also comes up in the idea that tourism governance needs to evolve to better manage scale: that tourism governance is generally concerned with the local-regional, while technological change is global. |
| **Governance**  **“horizontal” dimension –range of actors involved** | - Oil-oriented topics connect with both government and business actors.  - The tourism topic, by contrast, is linked with community, city, as keywords, but less to government-oriented keywords (i.e. tourism as local, oil as national?). Compared with oil, the tourism topic also clusters less with business-oriented keywords. | - Talk about oil governance includes quite a bit on oil risk mitigation, linked to offshore oil environmental risk and sustainability discourse. Mostly, this is framed in positive terms and oil risk is seen as something that is being managed. This also links to oil-government collaboration, as well as some talk about Scottish Natural Heritage input on oil governance and risk mitigation. In general, talk about risk mitigation positions the sector as responsible.  - Talk about oil-government collaboration comes up quite a lot (6 participants, from the oil and government sectors) and is one of the most prominent themes related to social network dynamics. This is often linked to talk about oil risk mitigation, as well as the positive social-economic impacts of oil for host communities. Shell is singled out as a key actor by a couple participants  - The most prominent theme on social futures is renewable energy transitions, which links to talk about government performance & policy on climate change and the role of oil in responding to climate change, as well as to talk about peak oil and decommissioning old wells, as well as the slow transition to low carbon economies with oil remaining important for the time being, much of which orients around issues of oil governance, climate change, and low-carbon futures.  - Talk about renewable energy transitions, then, is also a place where we see government (in terms of policy) and the oil sector (in terms of playing a role in terms of transferring skills and expertise) as key actors engaged in co-producing energy futures.  - Tourism-government collaboration is the most frequent theme related to social network dynamics, and is discussed by 8 participants from government and tourism sectors. Talk about tourism-government collaboration identifies several key influential actors in the collaboration network, including: Scottish Enterprise, Scottish Tourism Alliance, Scottish Natural Heritage, the Scottish Government and Visit Scotland. My impression is that the government-tourism collaboration network is much better developed in this case than in most of the others, with several key government and tourism sector organizations highly engaged in collaboration for tourism development, promotion, and governance.  - Another key theme related to social network dynamics is collaboration among tourism industry actors (raised by four participants from government and tourism). This is often linked to the regional collaboration for tourism development and the positive social-economic impacts of tourism for host communities. This is also often linked to talk about tourism government collaboration, and includes mentions of Visit Scotland as a particular key actor in collaboration networks.  - Talk about practices of media-work highlights this as a particular site of tourism sector-government collaboration around tourism development, with specific references to using websites and web 2.0 applications as forms of promotion and media visibility, with specific references to the importance of Facebook for doing media work of promotion and building a tourism destination image. - Relatedly, coding for Tourism Destination Image also shows this work as a site of tourism-government collaboration, with Visit Scotland as a key actor.  - The main theme re: tourism governance is “building tourism governance,” the notion that this is an evolving process, with improvements in collaboration and engagement across various tourism sector and government agencies, and that tourism is generally receiving more visibility and importance in government (i.e. Scottish government). There is also some talk linked to this about public participation in tourism governance. This is also linked to talk about tourism sustainability discourse, and the SNP and Visit Scotland as key actors.  - Coding for social network dynamics also includes several instances of cross-case linkages, speaking to regional connectivity and relationships. This includes talk about oil sector connectivity with Norway and Stavanger, for example, as well as tourism sector connectivity with Iceland. | - Material on social network dynamics includes a few, but interesting, points on oil-government collaboration, mostly from the Aberdeen fieldnotes, where we see more calls for collaboration between the sector (represented via Oil & Gas UK) and government to deal with challenges of Brexit, price cycles, etc… and navigate “innovation” and “sustainability” within an oil sector that is now becoming “marginal forever” (interesting term for the post-peak fields in this region).  - The main relevant theme in the fieldnotes is on oil risk mitigation. Interestingly, there is a particularly notable moment (at the Aberdeen Maritime Museum) that highlights the importance of Greenpeace’s Brent Spar campaign for shaping the risk management regime and pushing oil governance towards greater sensitivity to sustainability issues.  - In coding for tourism governance, the role of key organizations, including the Scottish Tourism Alliance and Wild Scotland, in lobbying government, or being a voice for the industry in interaction with government comes up a few times.  - In terms of network dynamics, the most recurrent themes, often linked with each other, are on collaboration within the tourism sector (connected to positive impacts of tourism, Tourism Destination Image; also to specific key actors including ScotRail, UK Inbound, Wild Scotland), and collaboration across the tourism sector and government (connected to positive impacts of tourism, tourism-university collaboration; also to specific key actors including Visit Scotland, Scottish Enterprise, the Scottish Government).  - In coding for government responses to climate change, there is an interesting moment (from the Wild Scotland event) on collaboration across government and the tourism sector to improve sustainability, carbon efficiencies related to climate change. | - The most frequent social network theme focuses on oil-government collaboration (8 references, across government & energy sector sites). Particularly in the Oil & Gas UK site, this is linked with notions of the oil industry as a field of technological innovation, government role supporting R&D, tax/fiscal regimes that support the oil sector.  - Government-tourism collaboration also comes up across a few sites.  - The main theme on oil governance focuses on oil risk mitigation, is featured mostly on oil sector sites (Oil & Gas UK; Wood Group; Maersk), and is linked to material on economic benefits of oil for host communities, oil sustainability discourse and oil-ENGO conflict. Oil risk mitigation is framed as a positive invoked alongside oil benefits.  - Government performance and policy re: climate change comes up across sites, mostly government and oil sector (particularly Scottish Enterprise and Oil & Gas UK). This is also cross-coded with material on renewable energy transitions. | -N/A | - While there is not a lot of contact across the oil and tourism sectors, there appears to be high levels of government-private sector collaboration in each of the oil sector and tourism sector.  - Government-oil collaboration includes stuff on policy/fiscal regimes, risk mitigation, as well as supporting research and development, as well as renewable energy transitions and decommissioning.  -There also appears to be a high level of government-tourism collaboration around marketing and promotion and developing tourism governance.  - Likewise, there appears to be a high level of collaboration within the tourism sector around marketing and promotion.  - Social movements are not highly visible, but it is notable that the Greenpeace Brent Spar campaign comes up as a critical event shaping oil governance around decommissioning issues. |
| **Social movements: when does intervention happen** | - Not present. | - Not too much here. The historical example of Greenpeace and the Brent Spar comes up a couple times, as does more recent conflicts over fracking. Otherwise, a few key ENGOs are discussed as being involved in tourism insofar as they are engaged in collaboration around parks and protected areas. | - The Greenpeace Brent Spar conflict is memorialized in the Aberdeen Maritime Museum as a key oil-as-tourism site, creating a narrative that mobilization around this issue was a key political event for shaping oil governance re: risk management & sustainability. | - Intervention around actually seems somewhat marginal, though it does come up occasionally. Among ENGO websites, there are interventions around fracking (UK in general, not necessarily Scotland specifically); around seabirds and oil risks among a suite environmental issues and risks of concerns; and around oil development in “globally significant” hotspots beyond Scotland, i.e. Arctic, AB oil sands.  - By contrast, there are examples of ENGO-tourism alignment and collaboration around tourism as a site of environmental education. | -N/A | - Overall, there is not much recent mobilization or engagement around oil issues within the data. The most significant is the historical event of the Greeenpeace Brent Spar campaign, which comes up as a critical historical event that provoked a re-think around issues of decommissioning within the oil sector and government.  - Anti-fracking campaigns (in the UK in general) also come up in ENGO-produced content.  - By contrast, ENGO engagement in tourism is more oriented around collaboration and tourism as a site of environmental education.  (PM: there are social movement cultures in Glasgow, Edinburgh, but mobilized around other (social) issues, so don’t equate this with a lack of activism per se.) |
| **Social movements:**  **Key discourses used to intervene in oil-tourism interface** | - Not present. | - Not much here. | - Not much here. | - Oil as a source of environmental risk comes up repeatedly, mostly in ENGO sites. Discussions of oil as a source of risk often link to seabirds, and also often arise in the context of parallel discussions of other environmental issues including climate change risks & impacts, and biodiversity issues.  - Main environmental issues on ENGO sites that are not specifically not necessarily explicitly linked to tourism and oil include concerns with a) biodiversity, which is presented in parallel with discussions of environmental risks of oil, and the risks and impacts of climate change. B) bird and wildlife protection also comes up across several ENGO sites, linked to discussions of whales, puffins, seabirds, seals, which also often appear as iconic animals as tourism attractors. | -N/A | - Oil development is a source of risk to seabirds and coastal environments, also linked to climate impacts and biodiversity issues.  - There is also a lot of focus on bird and wildlife protection (whales, puffins, seabirds, seals). Though this is not generally framed through tourism, these are key nature-oriented tourism attractors. |
| **Social movements: repertoire of action, tactics** | - Not present. | - Not much here. | - Not much here. | - Not too much here. Among protest tactics and repertoires of action we see a focus on a) protest rallies and marches related to fracking protest (3 refs, Greenpeace); b) environmental education initiatives related to birdwatching (2 refs, RSPB); and c) calls for volunteering (2 refs, RSPB and Greenpeace) | -N/A | - Not too much here. There is some material on protest rallies and marches related to fracking protest (UK in general, Greenpeace); environmental education initiatives from RSPB (which is a key ENGO actor that engages in tourism development); and calls for volunteering. |
| **Social movements:**  **structure of field** | - Not present. | - The key ENGOs that come up as organizational actors in the fieldnotes are Royal Society for the Protection of Birds.  - Greenpeace also comes up as a key organizational actor. | - The key ENGOs that come up as organizational actors in the fieldnotes are Royal Society for the Protection of Birds.  - The Greenpeace Brent Spar conflict comes up as part of a historical narrative of the evolution of oil governance towards greater responsibility & sustainability. | - The key ENGOs that come up as organizational actors are the Royal Society for the Protection of Birds, then also Greenpeace and Bird Life International. | -N/A | - The main organizations that come up are 1) the Royal Society for the Protection of Birds, which is Scottish/UK-based and is more engaged in tourism-related issues, including tourism-ENGO collaboration around tourism as a site of environmental education; 2) Greenpeace, which is the national office of the international major ENGO, which comes up more in conflict around oil and gas development.  (PM: Lots of larger ENGOs headquartered in London, flows of activist capital & resources focus more on the capital, don’t flow north. Other than focus on local issues.) |
| **Social movements:**  **Collaboration & conflict networks** | - Not present. | - It only comes up for a few (3) participants, but there is talk about government-ENGO collaboration, particularly around work in parks & protected areas (i.e. nature reserves). | - The Greenpeace Brent Spar conflict (vs. Shell) comes up as a key historical case as part of the oil-as-tourism narrative at Aberdeen Maritime Museum. | - Tourism-ENGO collaboration comes up across a couple sites, particularly Wild Scotland (where it is relatively prevalent) and the RSPB. This is linked with seabirds, bird & wildlife protection, impacts of climate change, oil as a source of environmental risk.  - Tourism as a notion of environmental education comes up across several websites, including both tourism and ENGO sites.  - ENGO-oil conflict comes up in a couple sites, including Oil & Gas UK and Greenpeace. Oil & Gas UK positions environmental movement critics as “other” in asserting economic benefits of oil and that safety and risk mitigation is well done. While the Greenpeace site focuses on the risks of offshore oil exploration and drilling – though this is focused not on the UK Continental Shelf, but on more “globally significant” sites like the Arctic, Amazon reef, AB oil sands. | -N/A | - ENGO-oil conflict comes up more as a historical critical event around the Greenpeace Brent Spar campaign, which shifted practice and policy around decommissioning.  - Oil-ENGO conflict also comes up in some of the web data, with ENGOs (aka Greenpeace in particular) positioned as oppositional to the oil sector.  - ENGO-government collaboration comes up around parks and protected areas. Similarly, ENGO-tourism collaboration comes up around tourism as a site of environmental education. |

Discourse network: potential key categories for discourse network analysis

CULTURE & COLLECTIVE IDENTITY

* Art, craft & culture as tourism attractors
* Food & drink as tourism performance
* History as tourism attractor
* Oil is important part of history & culture
* Rural coastal communities = authenticity and history

ECOLOGICAL NETWORKS

* Dolphins
* Puffins
* Seabirds
* Seals
* Whales
* Energy trilemma
* Government Performance and Policy re: GCC
* Oil role in responding to climate change
* Risks & impacts of CC
* Tourism contributes to CC
* Coastline, seascape as focal point
* Ecological value of coastal areas
* Highlands
* Mountain landscape as focal point
* Wilderness
* Biodiversity
* Bird & Wildlife Protection
* Fracking
* Negative impacts of renewables
* Beach walking
* Birdwatching
* Boat Tours
* Cruise ships
* Golf
* Hiking
* Skiing
* Coast as site of oil extraction
* Decommissioning old wells
* Mature fields are an issue
* Oil\_source of environmental risk
* Marine Protected Areas
* Cairngorms national park
* Corporate environmental responsibility
* Oil industry sustainability discourse
* Tourism is space for environmental education
* Tourism\_sustainability discourse

MEDIA COMMUNICATION NETWORKS

* Mass media representations order tourism mobility
* Photography as tourist practice
* Practices of media work
* Tourism Destination Image
* Using web 2.0 applications

MOBILITY NETWORKS

* Aeromobility
* Aquamobility
* Automobility
* Offshore oil structures migration

NETWORK POWER

* Age
* Class-profession
* Gender
* Global region
* America
* China
* Race & ethnicity
* Rules that structure network

POLITICAL NETWORKS

* Failure to capture benefits of oil
* Oil risk mitigation is well done
* Scotland vs. UK government
* Brexit
* Scottish Independence Referendum
* Trump election in US
* Environmental education initiatives
* Protest rally, march
* Volunteering
* Building tourism governance
* Lobbying government on behalf of tourism networks
* (Tourism) Regulations, policy need to adapt to modern technology

SOCIAL FUTURES

* Co-existence of fossil fuels and renewables
* Envisioning post-oil society
* Renewable energy transition

SOCIAL NETWORK DYNAMICS

* ENGO-Government collaboration
* Oil-government collaboration
* Tourism collaboration across industry actors
* Tourism-ENGO collaboration
* Tourism-government collaboration
* Oil-ENGO conflict
* Cross-case linkages
* Social learning

SOCIAL-ECONOMIC NETWORKS

* Challenges of oil for host societies
* Downturn=restructuring of oil industry
* Oil industry is cyclical, volatile
* Oil sector is an international network
* Optimism\_rebounding oil cycle
* Positive social-economic impacts of oil for host communities
  + Economic benefits
  + Oil employment
* Oil is a tourism attractor
* Oil-tourism interface\_complementary development paths
* Oil-tourism interface\_incompatible development paths
* Challenges of tourism for host communities
* Positive social-economic impacts of tourism for host communities
* Technological innovation, adaption (tourism)
* Tourism is underdeveloped

KEY ORGANIZATIONAL ACTORS (for potential two-mode analysis)

Energy sector

* BP
* Maersk
* Oil & Gas UK
* Shell

ENGOs

* Bird Life International
* Greenpeace
* Royal Society for the Protection of Birds

Government

* City of Aberdeen
* Scottish Enterprise
* Scottish Government
* Scottish National Heritage
* UK Government

International Agencies

Media sector

* Facebook
* Flickr
* Google
* Instagram
* Twitter
* You Tube

Tourism Sector

* Air BnB
* Rabbie’s Tours
* Scottish Seabird Centre
* Scottish Tourism Alliance
* Trip Advisor
* Trivago
* UK & Scottish B&B Association
* Visit Scotland
* Wild Scotland